

The role of Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) in Clinical Self-Assessment of Quality of Service Offered to the Patients under Chronic Hemodialysis in Rwanda

Etienne Ntabanganyimana^{1,2,3,*}, Theophile Nishimwe³, Jean Baptiste Tuyishime³, Astrid Bora^{2,3}, Benjamin Kyavulikira^{3,4}, Eugene Nyandwi^{3,4}, Joseph Ntarindwa³, Vincent Lloyd³

¹International Society of Nephrology Fellow, Department of Nephrology, Christian Medical College, Vellore, India. ²Gihundwe Hospital, Western Province, Rwanda. ³Africa Healthcare Network (AHN)-Rwanda, Kigali, Rwanda ⁴Gisenyi Hospital, Western Province, Rwanda

ABSTRACT

Introduction: Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) are quantifiable metrics used in managing patients under hemodialysis and measuring performance in care quality. This study examined the performance of hemodialysis centers at Africa Healthcare Network, Rwanda using KPIs.

Methods: We analyzed the data recorded in Clinicea (electronic file) between February and November 2022, using KPIs.

Results: In all three centers during the above-mentioned period, all sessions were recorded; in more than 94% of patients, their Kt/V urea was recorded, and the target varied between 69% to 85%; almost half of the patients did their blood tests, and less than three quarters met the target. Few patients had AVF (30% in November). The beds were under-used; no center has met two shifts per day at 100%, the same for the nurses with less than 2.5 sessions per nurse per day.

Conclusion: This study showed that the hemodialysis centers were performing fairly and highlights the need for improving the quality of care, especially in Low-Income Countries like Rwanda, where there is a shortage of Physicians and Nephrologists.

INTRODUCTION

*Corresponding author: Etienne Ntabanganyimana

International Society of Nephrology Fellow, Department

of Nephrology, Christian

Received: May 23 2023

role of Key Performance

Indicators (KPIs) in clinical self-assessment of quality of

service offered to the patients under chronic hemodialysis in

Rwanda. Rw. Public Health Bul.

Cite this article as: Ntabanganyimana et al. The

2023. 4 (3): 20-30.

Medical College, Vellore, India Email: ntet07@yahoo.fr.

Accepted: September 26, 2023

Published: December 31, 2023

Hemodialysis is needed when kidneys are not able to clean the blood by removing fluid and enough waste. This procedure uses the dialysis machine and a special filter, an artificial kidney called a dialyzer, and through vascular access, it is connected to the patient [1]. It helps control blood pressure and balance important minerals, such as serum sodium, potassium, and calcium. It gives supportive care to improve quality of life and live longer but does not cure kidney failure [2].

Chronic kidney disease (CKD) is defined as a

clinical syndrome associated with a definitive change in the structure of the kidney or kidney function; it is mainly irreversible or associated with slow and progressive evolution [3].

CKD is associated with high-risk complications and mortality3. In adult patients, CKD is defined with a glomerular filtration rate (GFR) less than 60 ml/min/1.73m2 or greater than 60 ml/min/1.73m2 when there is evidence of renal structure injury [4]. Worldwide, the incidence of CKD is increasing; the average is estimated to be 150-200 per million population, and its prevalence is estimated to be

Potential Conflicts of Interest: No potential conflicts of interest disclosed by all authors. Academic Integrity: All authors confirm their substantial academic contributions to development of this manuscript as defined by the International Committee of Medical Journal Editors. Originality: All authors confirm their substantial academic contributions to development of this manuscript as an original piece of work, and confirm that has not been published elsewhere. Review: All authors allow this manuscript to be peer-reviewed by independent reviewers in a double-blind review process. © Copyright: The Author(s). This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY-NC-ND), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited. Publisher: Rwanda Health Communication Centre, KG 302st., Kigali-Rwanda. Print ISSN: 2663 - 4651; Online ISSN: 2663 - 4653. Website: https://tbc.gov.rw/publichealthbulletin/

800 per million population [4]. Globally, there is an annual increase of 7% in needing chronic dialysis [4,5]. In sub-Saharan Africa, aging, lifestyle modification, and rapid urbanization are the basis of CKD increment in addition to the overspreading of HIV, diabetes mellitus, hypertension, and obesity [5].

Physicians and patients have to decide together subjective and objective parameters before starting dialysis [3]. The physician has to evaluate the quality of life, fall in renal function, and the patient's psychology since the dialysis is started when the patient becomes symptomatic or if there are remarkable changes in laboratory results suggesting a high risk of developing symptoms [3].

Hemodialysis outcomes are influenced by several factors, such as quality of life, socio-demographics, and comorbidities, making it difficult to do followup and may worsen outcomes [6]. Therefore, Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) are essential in managing patients under hemodialysis. KPIs are quantifiable metrics that express an institution's performance in fulfilling its goals and objectives [7].

KPIs are used to assess and improve the quality of renal services at CKD clinics, dialysis clinics, and transplant clinics without extra funding [7]. KPIs are used to set measurable goals in a certain time range, followed by performance assessment, recommendations, and next steps [7]. This study examined the performace of hemodialysis centers at Africa Healthcare Network (AHN) using KPIs, and its findings can help improve clinical service provided to CKD patients in Rwanda. AHN is the first and largest dialysis centers in Rwanda. The findings would inform strategies under development to expand the dialysis centers

 Table 1: Clinicea Data Entry

countrywide since Rwanda has only 7 centers, mostly concentrated in Kigali city.

METHODS

Study design: This was a retrospective study conducted at three hemodialysis centers of AHN, Rwanda (Gihundwe dialysis center and Gisenyi dialysis center in remote area and Kimihurura standalone center in the City of Kigali). We analyzed the recorded data in Clinicea (electronic file in use at Africa Healthcare Network, Rwanda, in consultation) from February to November 2022. The hemodialysis sessions, blood tests results, Kt/V urea, vascular access types, catheter infections breakdown, admissions, bed occupancy, deaths, and daily presented nursing staff were recorded.

Statistical analysis: Recorded data in Clinicea were exported to Microsoft Excel 2021 for analysis. Descriptive statistics was performed and data was presented in frequencies (n) and percentages (%).

Ethical considerations: Both ethical approval and informed consent were waived by Gihundwe Hospital and Gisenyi Hospital, Education and Research Committees considering the study's retrospective nature, as it used the anonymized records that existed in dialysis centers and did not involve interaction with the patients.

RESULTS

We found 67 patients at all centers, with all sessions (100%) recorded in Clinicea (Table 1). From May to November 2022, more than 94% of their Kt/V urea was tested and recorded, the patients who did serum albumin test dropped from 51% to 42%. There was an improvement in

	Total Sessions	Sessions entered in Clinicea	% of sessions entered in Clinicea
Total	1,053	1,052	100%
Kimihurura	671	670	100%
Gisenyi	192	192	100%
Gihundwe	190	190	100%



Figure 1: Patient level KPIs: Blood tests (percentage of the patients tested from May to November)



Figure 2: Patient level KPIs review: Blood tests (Percentage of the patients meeting target values)

Rw. Public Health Bul. Vol. 4 (4); December 2023.

testing Ferritin from 29% to 37%. Other elements like Calcium, Phosphate, and Hemoglobin did not change (Figure 1).

From May to November 2022, there was an improvement in patients meeting KT/v target levels from 69% to 85% with much difference between October and November 2022 (From 77% to 85%), there was a fall in patients with target levels of serum albumin and calcium-phosphorus tests from 63% to 9% and 82% to 58% respectively, and for other elements, there was no much change (Figure 2). For hemoglobin, 40% of the patients met the target levels (Hb 11-12g/dl). Gihundwe dialysis center had a high percentage of

Table 2: Patient Hemoglobin Breakdown

patients with anemia (Hb <8g/dl), and Kimihurura Standalone had a high number of patients with anemia (Hb<8g/dl) (Table 2).

Target hemoglobin levels over a period of time at Gisenyi dialysis centers had dropped to 30% by June 2022, while the patients of Gihundwe dialysis center had reached their apogee of 90% (Figure 3).

For vascular access type, there was an increase in the number of patients who had Arteriovenous fistula (AVF) (21% to 30%); on the other side, there was a fall in the number of patients who had Permanent cannula (PC) from 66% to 57% (Figure 4). June had the highest prevalence of infections

HEMOGLOBIN (g/dl)	<8	8-9	9-10	10-11	11-12
RWANDA (%)	16%	7%	15%	21%	40%
KIMIHURURA (%)	16%	5%	19%	22%	38%
GISENYI (%)	7%	13%	20%	7%	54%
GIHUNDWE (%)	27%	7%	0%	33%	33%



Figure 3: Patient level KPIs: Blood tests (Patients meeting hemoglobin target overtime in centers



Figure 4: Other clinical outcomes-Vascular access types (AVF: Arteriovenous fistula; PC: Permanent cannula, and IJC: Internal jugular catheter)



Figure 5: Other clinical outcomes (Percentage of infections, admissions and mortality)

(5%), and November recorded the highest prevalence of admissions (3%) and mortality (1%) (Figure 5).

The overall average sessions per day to nursing staff ratio was around 2.3 per nurse per day, with the highest record in Kimihurura standalone, where the ratio was 2.5 per nurse per day in September 2022 (Figure 6).

For the bed occupancy at all centers, many shifts were done in November 2022, with two full shifts at 60% on average, with the highest in Kimihurura standalone (85%) (Figure 7).

Comparing October and November 2022, in data recording in Clinicea, there was no much difference



Figure 6: Operational KPIs: Average sessions per day to nursing staff ratio

	Kt/V	Albumin	Hemoglobin	TSAT	Ferritin	Serum Ca	Serum Po4	Ca*PO4
			OCTOBER BO	OD TESTS				
Total	98%	45%	62%	0%	37%	58%	43%	43%
KIMIHURURA	97%	46%	52%	0%	37%	49%	43%	43%
GISENYI	100%	50%	69%	0%	38%	69%	50%	50%
GIHUNDWE	100%	38%	94%	0%	38%	81%	38%	38%
		Ν	NOVEMBER BL	OOD TEST	s			
Total	98%	42%	62%	0%	37%	52%	46%	46%
KIMIHURURA	99%	42%	50%	0%	38%	42%	39%	39%
GISENYI	94%	69%)	94%	0%	44%	75%	56%	56%
GIHUNDWE	100%	17%	83%	0%	28%	72%	67%	67%

Table 3: Clinical KPI: October Blood tests (Percentage of patients tested in October and November)

between the two months but by stratification, the Gihundwe dialysis center had recorded 100% Kt/V urea in both months (Table 3), and in meeting the

target levels. No TSAT recorded.

At all centers, the percentage of patients achieving target Kt/V urea increased from 77% to 85%, the

	Kt/v	Albumin	Hemoglobin	Ferritin	Serum Ca	Serum Po4	Ca*PO4	
OCTOBER BLOOD TESTS								
Total	77%	18%	56%	81%	49%	74%	70%	
KIMIHURURA	82%	13%	49%	80%	58%	76%	69%	
GISENYI	44%	13%	82%	67%	18%	75%	75%	
GIHUNDWE	94%	50%	53%	100%	54%	67%	67%	
		NOV	EMBER BLO	OD TESTS				
Total	85%	9%	61%	83%	41%	80%	58%	
KIMIHURURA	84%	6%	59%	82%	55%	72%	69%	
GISENYI	73%	9%	60%	71%	33%)	100%	44%	
GIHUNDWE	100%	33%	67%	100%	15%	83%	42%	

Table 4: Clinical KPIs: October Blood tests (Percentage of the patients meeting the target and average value between October and November)

Sept Oct Nov



Figure 7: Operational KPIs: Bed occupancy

 Table 5: Clinical KPI: Other clinical outcomes (Vascular access between October and November)

	Fistula	Permanent catheter	Acute catheter				
VASCULAR ACCESS IN OCTOBER							
Total	29%	58%	11%				
KIMIHURURA	39%	45%	13%				
GISENYI	6%	81%	13%				
GIHUNDWE	13%	88%	0%				
VASCULAR ACCESS IN OCTOBER							
Total	30%	57%	12%				
KIMIHURURA	38%	45%	16%				
GISENYI	13%	88%	0%				
GIHUNDWE	11%	83%	6%				

Table 6: Clinical KPIs: Catheter-related infection, hospital admissions and mortality between October and November

	Catheter infection	Hospital admission (all patients)	Hospital admission (CKD only)	Mortality (all patients)	Mortality (CKD only)			
OCTOBER CLINICAL OUTCOMES								
Total	1%	1%	1%	0%	0%			
KIMIHURURA	1%	0%	0%	0%	0%			
GISENYI	0%	5%	5%	0%	0%			
GIHUNDWE	0%	0%	0%	0%)	0%			
NOVEMBER CLINICAL OUTCOMES								
Total	3%	3%	3%	1%	1%			
KIMIHURURA	4%	3%	3%	1%	1%			
GISENYI	5%	0%	0%	0%	0%			
GIHUNDWE	0%	10%	10%	0%	0%			

Ntabanganyimana et al.

Gisenyi hemodialysis center saw the most increase, from 44% to 73%. Patients with the hemoglobin target dropped from 82% to 60% at Gisenyi dialysis center, and patients with calcium target dropped from 54% to 15% at Gihundwe center but the percentage of patients with phosphorus target has increased from 67% to 83% at Gihundwe dialysis center and patients with albumin target dropped from 13% to 6% at Kimihurura standalone (Table 4).

In all centers, the patients using AVF increased from 29% to 30% between October and Novemeber with the highest increase at Gisenyi dialysis center (from 6% to 13%), and there was no patient using IJC at Gisenyi dialysis center in November 2022 (Table 5).

Regarding catheter-related bloodstream infections (CRBSI), hospital admissions (all patients or CKD patients only), and mortality of all dialysis patients or patients with CKD only at all centers, the highest percentage of admissions for CKD patients (5%) and all patients (5%), in general, was in Gisenyi dialysis center in October, which droped to 0% in November. In contrast Gihundwe dialysis center which had recorded no admissions in October, reported the highest percentage (10%) for both types of admissions in November. Gisenti dialysis center had the highest number of patients with CRBSI (5%) in November, while it had none (0%) in October (Table 6).

DISCUSSION

KPIs in monitoring and reporting are key to delivering standard hemodialysis service, and their implementation may help measure adherence to the dialysis standards [7]. Due to the increasing under patients` number chronic dialysis. implementing KPIs was found to help improve the CKD medical treatment system for early detection, optimal management, and criteria for referral to a nephrologist with the goal of achieving a reduction of new dialysis patients [8]. This study assessed how AHN dialysis centers performed in Rwanda, using KPIs.

The findings showed that an overall improvement in meeting target levels of Kt/v, and hemoglobin from May to November 2022. Kt/V urea of is associated with good general health status [9], but very difficult to achieve Kt/V urea of 1.45, especially in men with body weight between 70 kg to 80 kg for treatments of 4.5 hours during dialysis [10]. The patients with high or low serum concentrations of

Rw. Public Health Bul. Vol. 4 (4); December 2023.

serum albumin-corrected calcium, phosphorus, and parathyroid hormone (PTH) have an increased risk of all-cause mortality [11]. We found a fall in patients with target serum albumin and calciumphosphorus levels between May and November. indicating an increased risk for patients. Low hemoglobin levels may also be attributed to the inaccessibility of the erythropoiesis-stimulating agent. Though patients on dialysis tend to have anemia, 40% of the patients met the target hemoglobin levels. Hemoglobin increase depends on erythropoietin response, nutrition status. inflammation, and oxidative stress markers. In addition, serum albumin concentration strongly predicts baseline hemoglobin and erythropoietin sensitivity, and its improvement improves anemia in hemodialysis patients [12]. Moreover, serum albumin concentration level in patients under chronic dialysis was found to be a predictor to determine the nutrition status of the patients [13]. Therefore, the fall in target albumin levels might have affected the achievement of hemoglobin levels in 60% of patients through multiple factors. Many patients missed investigations, which is associated with high-frequency reagents stock-out in laboratories of public hospitals, and support the study which documented sub-optimal diagnosis capacity of kidney diseases in different hospitals in Rwanda [14].

We found an increase in the number of patients who had AVF. However, the patients with AVF remained few, which may be attributed to a lack of vascular surgeons in Rwanda. AVF is considered the gold standard hemodialysis vascular access [15], and efforts should be made to increase its use in patients under hemodialysis. At Kimihurura standalone, two full shifts reached 80% in November, which is attributed to the dialysis accessibility, and the patients rarely miss the scheduled dialysis sessions compared to the rest of the centers of remote areas. In Rwanda, 90% use Community Base Health Insurance (CBHI) [16], a public universal health insurance. The CBHI beneficiaries do not have access to chronic dialysis unless they are able to pay for 100% hemodialysis services. This may justify the low rate of bed occupancy, low nurseto-hemodialysis session ratios, and the inability to reach at least two full shifts per day. Besides this, the nephrologist to hemodialysis patients ratio in the studied centers was 1:67, highlighting the need for nephrologists in Rwanda as one nephrologist covered all three centers during the study period. The staff shortage might affect service delivery, leading to complications, such as infection [17,18]. In Sub-Saharan countries, the shortage of trained nursing staff and nephrologists was reported to affect the dialysis service delivery [17]. This aligns with our findings and might have contributed to CRBSI in dialysis centers, as it might lead to less change of catheters, increasing the risk of infections. CRBSI at some centers also aligns with low levels of hemoglobin and albumin recorded in those centers, indicating their contributions to the infection. Studies have shown that catheter type and duration, comorbidity, immunosuppression, low hemoglobin level, and low albumin level were significantly linked with CRBSI [19], all of which are more prevalent among dialysis patients.

There are some limitations to this study that should be considered. We could not include TSAT in KPIs. TSAT testing was not done at all centers, which might be attributed to the lack of materials/ reagents. However, testing TSAT is important as it helps monitor the response to erythropoiesisstimulating agents and/or iron therapy in CKD. Moreover, the KPIs used in our study did not include injectable erythropoiesis-stimulating agent and iron sucrose, serum glucose, glycated hemoglobin, missed scheduled hemodialysis sessions, BMI, and vital signs monitoring because their details were missing or incomplete in patients' files.

REFERENCES

[1] National Kidney Foundation, "Treatment and Support." Accessed: Dec. 17, 2023. [Online]. Available: https://www.kidney.org/treatment-support

[2] National Institute of Diabetes and Digestive and Kidney Diseases, "Hemodialysis." Accessed: Dec. 17, 2017. [Online]. Available: https://niddk.nih.gov/ health-information/kidney-disease/kidney-failure/ hemodialysis

[3] A. L. Ammirati, "Chronic Kidney Disease," Rev. Assoc. Med. Bras., vol. 66, no. suppl 1, pp. s03–s09, 2020, doi: 10.1590/1806-9282.66.s1.3.

[4]A. Grassmann, S. Gioberge, S. Moeller, and G. Brown, "ESRD patients in 2004: global overview of patient numbers, treatment modalities and associated trends," Nephrol Dial Transplant, vol. 20, no. 12, pp. 2587–2593, Dec. 2005, doi: 10.1093/ndt/gfi159.

[5] J. W. Stanifer et al., "The epidemiology of chronic kidney disease in sub-Saharan Africa: a systematic review and meta-analysis," The Lancet Global Health, vol. 2, no. 3, pp. e174–e181, Mar. 2014, doi: 10.1016/S2214-109X(14)70002-6.

CONCLUSION

Our findings show that services provided at AHN dialysis centers in Rwanda generally improved. This indicates that KPIs may help self-assessment of the dialysis services offered to chronic hemodialysis patients. The findings of this study highlight weaknesses to improve, such as increasing patients meeting Kt/v urea, hemoglobin, albumin, and calcium and phosphorus targets. The number of nutritionists and local vascular surgeons should also be increased. Health officials and partners should increase laboratory reagents to improve Kt/V urea testing has to be recorded 100% and meet the target as it is used to measure vascular access patency. The physicians have to check the adherence and compliance of the drug with the patients, and also to put enough effort in TSAT testing. The Ministry of Health needs to collaborate with different stakeholders in order to improve renal service in terms of dialysis accessibility and increase the number of nephrologists and laboratory equipment.

Acknowledgment: We acknowledge all staff of Africa Healthcare Network, Rwanda, especially the nurses who recorded the items in Clinicea in addition to monitoring the patients during hemodialysis.

[6] C. R. Pretto, E. R. Winkelmann, L. M. Hildebrandt, D. A. Barbosa, C. D. F. Colet, and E. M. F. Stumm, "Quality of life of chronic kidney patients on hemodialysis and related factors," Rev. Latino-Am. Enfermagem, vol. 28, p. e3327, 2020, doi: 10.1590/1518-8345.3641.3327.

[7] N. D. Toussaint et al., "Implementation of renal key performance indicators: Promoting improved clinical practice: Renal key performance indicators," Nephrology, vol. 20, no. 3, pp. 184–193, Mar. 2015, doi: 10.1111/nep.12366.

[8] A. Fukui, T. Yokoo, M. Nangaku, and N. Kashihara, "New measures against chronic kidney diseases in Japan since 2018," Clin Exp Nephrol, vol. 23, no. 11, pp. 1263–1271, Nov. 2019, doi: 10.1007/s10157-019-01786-7.

[9] J. B. Chen et al., "Relationship between Kt/V ureabased dialysis adequacy and nutritional status and their effect on the components of the quality of life in incident peritoneal dialysis patients," BMC Nephrol, vol. 13, p. 39, Jun. 2012, doi: 10.1186/1471-2369-13-39.

[10] B. A. Fritz, S. Doss, L. M. McCann, and E. M. Wrone, "A comparison of dual dialyzers in parallel and series to improve urea clearance in large hemodialysis

patients," American Journal of Kidney Diseases, vol. 41, no. 5, pp. 1008–1015, May 2003, doi: 10.1016/S0272-6386(03)00198-7.

[11] M. Naves-Diaz et al., "Calcium, phosphorus, PTH and death rates in a large sample of dialysis patients from Latin America. The CORES Study," Nephrology Dialysis Transplantation, vol. 26, no. 6, pp. 1938–1947, Jun. 2011, doi: 10.1093/ndt/gfq304.

[12] R. Agarwal, J. L. Davis, and L. Smith, "Serum Albumin Is Strongly Associated with Erythropoietin Sensitivity in Hemodialysis Patients," Clinical Journal of the American Society of Nephrology, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 98–104, Jan. 2008, doi: 10.2215/CJN.03330807.

[13] C. H. Yang, Y.-S. Chen, J.-B. Chen, H.-C. Huang, and L.-Y. Chuang, "Application of deep learning to predict the low serum albumin in new hemodialysis patients," Nutr Metab (Lond), vol. 20, no. 1, p. 24, Apr. 2023, doi: 10.1186/s12986-023-00746-z.

[14] G. Igiraneza, V. Dusabejambo, F. O. Finklestein, and A. Rastegar, "Challenges in the Recognition and Management of Acute Kidney Injury by Hospitals in Resource-Limited Settings," Kidney International Reports, vol. 5, no. 7, pp. 991–999, Jul. 2020, doi: 10.1016/j.ekir.2020.04.003. [15] N. Gedney, "Arteriovenous Fistula or Dialysis Catheter: A Patient's Perspective," Kidney360, vol.
3, no. 6, pp. 1109–1110, Jun. 2022, doi: 10.34067/ KID.0001462022.

[16] Pacific Prime, "Rwanda Health Insurance." Accessed: Sep. 26, 2023. [Online]. Available: https:// www.pacificprime.com/country/africa/rwanda-healthinsurance/

[17] M. Japiong, C. K. Landy, M. T. Fox, J. Mensah, and P. Adatara, "Factors affecting access to dialysis for patients with end-stage kidney disease in Sub-Saharan Africa: A scoping review," Nurs Open, vol. 10, no. 10, pp. 6724–6748, Oct. 2023, doi: 10.1002/nop2.1970.

[18] A. T. Tamata and M. Mohammadnezhad, "A systematic review study on the factors affecting shortage of nursing workforce in the hospitals," Nurs Open, vol. 10, no. 3, pp. 1247–1257, Mar. 2023, doi: 10.1002/nop2.1434.

[19] M. K. Weldetensae, M. G. Weledegebriel, A. T. Nigusse, E. Berhe, and H. Gebrearegay, "Catheter-Related Blood Stream Infections and Associated Factors Among Hemodialysis Patients in a Tertiary Care Hospital," Infect Drug Resist, vol. 16, pp. 3145–3156, 2023, doi: 10.2147/IDR.S409400.